Effective instructors use evidence-based inclusive practices that are fundamental to student success.

### Curriculum / Curricular Alignment

- Adopt [practices grounded in inclusive curriculum](#)
- Use [backwards design](#) to align all course content, assignments, and assessments
- Add an [inclusivity statement](#) to your syllabus
- Make sure your syllabus, textbooks, resources, and coursework are accessible to all learners according to the CSU [Accessibility by Design](#) website

### Classroom Climate

- Create an inclusive and welcoming environment
- Help students learn how to communicate equitably and productively with each other
- Provide opportunities for [students to work with others](#) - and for students to see the value of diverse perspectives
- Use the [appropriate language](#) when referring to social groups

### Pedagogical Content Knowledge

- Keep current on issues of racism/sexism, current racial tensions, and contemporary cultural issues in the United States, especially in relation to your discipline
- Proactively address [common student misconceptions](#)
- Assess prior knowledge of learners; use it to plan/revise class sessions

### Student Motivation

- Use content and connections that align with your current group of students’ backgrounds, interests, and reasons for taking the course
- Make content relevant to all students’ lives; clearly link concepts/lessons to industry, a broader purpose, future classes/activities, or a transferable skill
- Use varied names and socio-cultural contexts in stories, test questions, and assignments

### Feedback & Assessment

- Create [rubrics](#) for assignments, papers, and presentations; share rubrics with students when presenting the assignment
- Provide structure and guidelines for student [group work and group assignments](#); guide and reteach [skills](#) for productive, [inclusive group work](#)
- Provide transparent [assignment directions](#); start with this [template](#)
- Use [Classroom Assessment Techniques](#) to check for understanding and to promote mental retrieval and [deep learning](#); this can be done in [residential, hybrid, and online courses](#)
- Vary assessments: quizzes, exams, [assignments](#), papers, projects, simulations, and presentations

### Instructional Strategies

- Use a variety of teaching methods and modalities (verbal, interactive, Socratic, etc.) that align with learning objectives
- Incorporate [Classroom Assessment Techniques](#) for individual processing, partner processing, or small group activities in a variety of teaching modalities
- Use [accessible slide presentations, documents, videos, and other course materials](#)
LEVELED CRITERIA & SELF ASSESSMENT RUBRIC

Use this rubric to reflect on your current instructional practices, set a teaching goal, and monitor growth. TILT recommends revisiting this throughout the year to continue to reflect and adjust as you work towards your goal. TILT does not recommend using this as an observation tool or for direct evaluation. See TILT's Recommended Process for Annual Review of Teaching to learn more about how to utilize this resource.

INCLUSIVE PEDAGOGY DOMAIN

Inclusive Pedagogy is a student-centered teaching approach that considers all students’ backgrounds, experiences, and learning variabilities. Instructors who ensure equitable access to course materials, foster belonging, and address the needs of a diverse student population create a more robust learning experience for all learners.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Developing</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inclusive Excellence, Training, and Practice:</td>
<td>Has participated in much training on inclusive excellence in teaching and regularly engages in further reading and reflection.</td>
<td>Has participated in some training on inclusive excellence in teaching and has explored some further reading and reflection.</td>
<td>Has participated in some training or reading on inclusive excellence in teaching.</td>
<td>Has not yet participated in training or reading on inclusive excellence in teaching.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Learning about Inclusive Excellence</td>
<td>Has awareness of student identities in the classroom and uses this knowledge to support student success.</td>
<td>Is developing awareness of student identities in the classroom and is beginning to use it to make instructional decisions that support students.</td>
<td>Is beginning to develop an awareness of the student identities in the classroom and is beginning to use it to support students.</td>
<td>Is not yet aware of all students’ identities in their classroom or what impact it has on student success.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Awareness of student identities in the classroom</td>
<td>Successful in mitigating their own and students’ assumptions, biases, and microaggressions in the classroom.</td>
<td>Has awareness of their own and students’ assumptions, biases, and microaggressions and is beginning to mitigate them in the classroom.</td>
<td>Is developing awareness of their own and students’ assumptions, biases, and microaggressions.</td>
<td>Has not yet considered their own assumptions and biases in relation to teaching.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Mitigation of assumptions, biases, and microaggressions in the classroom</td>
<td>Inclusive Teaching Practices</td>
<td>Intentionally and actively incorporates inclusive teaching practices in all aspects of the curriculum and the classroom to increase awareness, content knowledge, cognitive sophistication, and sense of community for every individual.</td>
<td>Regularly incorporates inclusive teaching practices in planning and delivery of content.</td>
<td>Incorporates some inclusive teaching practices in planning and delivery of content.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Inclusive Teaching Practices

• Use of evidence-based practices from the other six domains of the TEF that are fundamental to being an inclusive instructor

Teaching Effectiveness Framework, The Institute for Learning and Teaching (TILT) (c)2023 Colorado State University CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0
Plan your course with evidence-based practices that provide an organized and inclusive foundation for students.

### Inclusive Curriculum

- Choose or create content that deliberately reflects the diversity of contributors to the field
- Adopt practices grounded in inclusive curriculum
- Use a variety of course materials: text, video, simulation, games, etc. to appeal to a variety of learning preferences
- Use visuals, examples, analogies, and humor that do not reinforce stereotypes but do include traditionally marginalized people or perspectives to ensure inclusivity
- Know the implications of religious perspectives regarding course content
- Ensure all of your course materials are accessible to all learners

### Learning Objectives/Outcomes

- Use Bloom’s or Fink’s Taxonomy to write clear and measurable learning outcomes
- Write outcomes that align with the cognitive demands of the course
- Write short-term outcomes for units, modules, or daily activities

### Course Alignment of Assessments & Activities

- Use backwards design to align all course content, assignments, and assessments
- Align assessments, assignments, and class activities with learning outcomes
- Align rigor of class activities, discussions, i-clicker questions, etc. with rigor of exams
- Design activities where students make connections between content and learning outcomes

### Syllabus

- Design a learner-centered syllabus (use this rubric to assess your syllabus)
- Add an inclusivity statement to your syllabus
- Make sure your syllabus, textbooks, resources, and coursework are accessible to all learners according to the CSU Accessibility by Design website
- Provide a visual map of the course, including alignment of objectives to assessments
- Include campus resources for students: TILT Tutoring, Student Resources and Campus Life

This icon indicates inclusive teaching practices that are fundamental to being an inclusive instructor. See TILT’s Recommended Process for Annual Review of Teaching to learn more about how to utilize this resource.
**LEVELED CRITERIA & SELF ASSESSMENT RUBRIC**

Use this rubric to reflect on your current instructional practices, set a teaching goal, and monitor growth. TILT recommends revisiting this throughout the year to continue to reflect and adjust as you work towards your goal. TILT does not recommend using this as an observation tool or for direct evaluation. See [TILT's Recommended Process for Annual Review of Teaching](#) to learn more about how to utilize this resource.

**CURRICULUM & CURRICULAR ALIGNMENT DOMAIN**

Curriculum and curricular alignment provide the foundation for any course. Instructors who connect course learning objectives, assignments, activities, and assessments provide students with a clear path to success in their course.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Developing</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Inclusive Curriculum</strong></td>
<td>Intentional variety is incorporated into most curricular materials and assignments. Purposeful use of materials outside the text with good representation of scholars from minoritized groups.</td>
<td>Variety in several curricular materials and assignments. Some use of materials outside the text, including scholars from minoritized groups.</td>
<td>Minimal variety of curricular materials and assignments. Use of some material other than the text - may or may not include scholars from minoritized groups.</td>
<td>Little to no variety in curricular materials and assignments. May be aware of the need for a variety of materials other than the text and need for materials by scholars from minoritized groups but has not yet integrated them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Learning Objectives</strong></td>
<td>All learning objectives are measurable and require evidence of critical thinking and abilities appropriate to the course level.</td>
<td>Most learning objectives are measurable and require evidence of critical thinking and abilities appropriate to the course level.</td>
<td>Some learning objectives are measurable and require evidence of critical thinking and abilities appropriate to the course level; others need specificity.</td>
<td>Learning objectives require more specificity to be measurable and/or require evidence of critical thinking and abilities appropriate to the course level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Course Alignment</strong></td>
<td>Connections between objectives, course materials, and assessments are explicit and consistent aspect of the course. Instructor provides clear guidelines and frequent opportunities for students to make connections within the course, the broader discipline, and the world.</td>
<td>Connections between objectives, course materials, and assessments are explicit. Instructor provides clear guidelines and some opportunities for students to make connections within course content and across courses.</td>
<td>Connections between objectives, course materials, and assessments are in the syllabus but not an explicit or consistent aspect of the course. Instructor occasionally provides opportunities for students to make a connection within course content.</td>
<td>Connections between objectives, course materials, and assessments are inconsistent and unclear. Instructor attempts to provide an opportunity for students to make connections within course content, but connections need development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Syllabus</strong></td>
<td>The syllabus sets a supportive, welcoming tone and contains an inclusivity statement, a visual representation of the course, and campus resources for students. It is a succinct and meaningful document that is used throughout the semester.</td>
<td>The syllabus sets a welcoming tone and contains most of the components listed in the “Advanced” column. It is sometimes referred to during the semester.</td>
<td>Syllabus has a neutral tone and contains some of the components listed in the “Advanced” column. It may contain too little or too much information, or the information may need to be more organized to be useful to students.</td>
<td>Word choice in the syllabus sets a negative or unsupportive tone. It does not contain much of the crucial information that supports student success as listed in the “Advanced” column, or the information is not organized well.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### References

Teaching Effectiveness Framework, The Institute for Learning and Teaching (TILT) (c)2023 Colorado State University CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0
Classroom Climate refers to the intellectual, social, emotional, and physical environment in which students learn. Instructors who intentionally create a safe space and foster a community of learners find that students are more engaged.

Choose from these evidence-based teaching practices to create a safe space for students to learn and to support each other.

### Inclusive and Welcoming Environment

- Use students’ names and pronounce them correctly - use name tents or seating charts in large classes
- Use students’ preferred pronouns
- Co-create class norms with your students, and establish a system to adhere to them
- Connect the content to the lived experiences of a variety of students
- Incorporate practices that create a sense of belonging for students, including international students, students of color, and students of all gender identities and all abilities
- Incorporate CSU Principles of Community into your class
- Ensure inclusivity and cultural awareness in your non-verbal communication, language, and symbolic representations
- Be intentional about your first day of class

### Instructor-Student Rapport

- Make time to answer student questions/create a system where all students ask questions
- Talk with students instead of at them
- Ask students for feedback on your teaching several times a semester; do something with their feedback
- Be authentic and vulnerable
- Create a welcoming and respectful environment
- Address bias and microaggressions in your classroom
- Use the appropriate language when referring to social groups
- Do not ask individuals to speak for an entire group of people

### Student-Student Rapport

- Create a system for everyone to call each other by name
- Help students learn how to communicate equitably and productively with each other
- Encourage students to be experts; allow them to teach concepts to each other
- Provide opportunities for students to work with others and for students to see the value of diverse perspectives
- Teach and model appropriate small group behaviors
- Model productive disagreement, showing how to critique a statement or idea rather than the speaker
- Assess the physical space of the classroom; consider the space and movement for discussions and activities
- Engage students in the content - through discussion, activities, and time to think
LEVELED CRITERIA & SELF ASSESSMENT RUBRIC

Use this rubric to reflect on your current instructional practices, set a teaching goal, and monitor growth. TILT recommends revisiting this throughout the year to continue to reflect and adjust as you work towards your goal. TILT does not recommend using this as an observation tool or for direct evaluation. See TILT’s Recommended Process for Annual Review of Teaching to learn more about how to utilize this resource.

CLASSROOM CLIMATE DOMAIN

Classroom Climate refers to the intellectual, social, emotional, and physical environment in which students learn. Instructors who intentionally create a safe space and foster a community of learners find that students are more engaged.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Developing</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inclusive and Welcoming Environment</td>
<td>Integrates teaching practices that foster a safe, challenging, supportive, engaged community of learners into all aspects of the course.</td>
<td>Integrates several teaching practices that foster a sense of community and create a challenging, safe, supportive, mostly engaged classroom.</td>
<td>The instructor periodically attempts teaching practices that build community.</td>
<td>Does not attempt teaching practices that build community or does this only during the first week of class.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructor-Student Rapport</td>
<td>Instructor is welcoming, authentic, vulnerable, and respectful of all students. Students actively participate without prompting. Feedback on the course is collected several times throughout the course, shared with students and is used to make instructional decisions. The instructor recognizes and takes action to mitigate bias in their own actions.</td>
<td>Instructor is welcoming, authentic, vulnerable, and respectful of all students. Students participate with some prompting. Feedback on the course is collected early and/or mid-course and is used to make instructional decisions. Instructor recognizes and takes action to mitigate bias in their own actions.</td>
<td>Instructor is welcoming. Students are encouraged to participate, and some attempt is made to keep them engaged. Feedback on the course is collected mid-course but not shared with students and/or used.</td>
<td>Student engagement is not addressed. Feedback is collected at the end of the course.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student-Student Rapport</td>
<td>Teaching practices foster a high level of student-student interaction throughout the course. Instructor creates opportunities for students to learn classmates’ names and use protocols for productive communication and group work. Instructor mitigates bias in classroom interactions and brings this awareness to students. Nearly all students engage with and support each other regularly – with and without prompting from the instructor.</td>
<td>Teaching practices prompt student-student interaction throughout the course. Instructor encourages students to learn classmates’ names and use protocols for productive communication and group work. Instructor takes action to mitigate bias in classroom interactions and brings this awareness to students. Many students engage with and support each other regularly – with and without prompting from the instructor.</td>
<td>Teaching practices occasionally encourage student-student interaction. Instructor takes action to mitigate bias in classroom interactions. Some students engage with and support each other; some students engage only with prompting from instructor; some do not engage with others at all.</td>
<td>Teaching practices do little to promote student-student engagement. Instructor does not recognize implicit biases that affect classroom interactions. Most students generally do not engage with each other about course content.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Effective instructors use evidence-based practices to make the connection between their students, the content area, and instructional strategies.

Knowledge of Content and Instructional Strategies

- Determine breadth and depth of content necessary for course level: align with pre-co-, and subsequent courses
- Present information in a sequence that makes sense to a (new, intermediate, advanced) learner
- Scaffold lessons and activities to support students in reaching the level of critical thinking needed to master course objectives
- Keep current on issues of racism/sexism, racial tensions, and contemporary cultural issues in the United States, especially in relation to your discipline
- Use a variety of instructional strategies to engage a variety of learners
- Determine which instructional strategies work best for your teaching style and your students
- Teach students about Bloom’s Taxonomy and how it relates to higher level thinking required for course concepts
- Provide explicit reading strategies for your discipline

Knowledge of Students

- Proactively address common student misconceptions
- Assess prior knowledge of learners; use it to plan/revise class sessions

Information Literacy

Collaborate with librarian to:

- Introduce students to discipline-specific databases to find relevant information for your assignments
- Support students in evaluating information sources for credibility and accuracy using the standards of your discipline
- Teach students how to consume information sources (e.g., research papers, blogs, audio visual, data sets, news articles, primary sources) in your discipline
- Demonstrate how to use information ethically—in accordance with the CSU Academic Integrity and Honesty guidelines.
- Teach students to create products (e.g., research papers, blogs, audio visual, data sets, news articles, primary sources) that align with your discipline

This icon indicates inclusive teaching practices that are fundamental to being an inclusive instructor.

See: TILT’s Recommended Process for Annual Review of Teaching to learn more about how to utilize this resource.
### LEVELED CRITERIA & SELF ASSESSMENT RUBRIC

Use this rubric to reflect on your current instructional practices, set a teaching goal, and monitor growth. TILT recommends revisiting this throughout the year to continue to reflect and adjust as you work towards your goal. TILT does not recommend using this as an observation tool or for direct evaluation. See [TILT’s Recommended Process for Annual Review of Teaching](#) to learn more about how to utilize this resource.

### PEDAGOGICAL CONTENT KNOWLEDGE DOMAIN

Pedagogical Content Knowledge is the intersection of content and pedagogical expertise. When instructors know their students’ prior knowledge and preconceptions, they intentionally choose instructional strategies that work best in their discipline for their current students.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Developing</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge of Content and Instructional Strategies</td>
<td>Instructor consistently uses evidence informed instructional strategies for that specific discipline. Instruction and assessments are effectively sequenced, appropriate for the level of students in the course, and consider abilities of current students. Instruction is dynamic and adapted in the moment when necessary.</td>
<td>Instructor uses several instructional strategies known to work for their discipline. Most instruction and assessments are effectively sequenced, appropriate for the level of learners in the course, and consider abilities of current students. Instruction is sometimes adapted in the moment when necessary.</td>
<td>Instructor uses some instructional strategies known to work for their discipline. Some instruction and assessments are effectively sequenced, appropriate to the level of learners in the course, and consider abilities of current students. Instruction is mostly static, one or two adjustments made when necessary.</td>
<td>Instructor uses some instructional strategies that may or may not work for their discipline. Instructor is unaware or unsure of whether concepts are effectively sequenced or appropriate for the level of learners in the course or consider abilities of current students. Instruction is static, no adjustments made for student needs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misconceptions, alternative conceptions, and preconceptions</td>
<td>The instructor intentionally addresses misconceptions, alternative conceptions, or preconceptions. They regularly make essential connections between course content, other courses in the curriculum, and to contemporary issues in the field.</td>
<td>The instructor addresses several misconceptions, alternative conceptions, or preconceptions. They make many relevant connections between course content, other courses in the curriculum, and to contemporary issues in the field.</td>
<td>The instructor addresses some misconceptions, alternative conceptions, or preconceptions. They occasionally make connections between course content, between courses in the curriculum, and to contemporary issues in the field.</td>
<td>The instructor addresses an occasional misconception. They do little to make clear connections between course content, other courses, and contemporary issues in the field.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Literacy</td>
<td>The instructor works with the discipline-specific librarian to develop students’ information literacy skills in relevant course assignments. Students are provided ongoing feedback (commensurate with experience level) in using discipline-specific databases and the ethical evaluation and consumption of data sources—in accordance with academic integrity and honesty guidelines.</td>
<td>The instructor works with the discipline-specific librarian to develop students’ information literacy skills in relevant course assignments. Students are provided some feedback (commensurate with experience level) in using discipline-specific databases and the ethical evaluation and consumption of data sources—in accordance with academic integrity and honesty guidelines.</td>
<td>The instructor refers students to library resources for research assignments. Students are encouraged to use discipline-specific databases and ethical evaluation and consumption of data sources—in accordance with academic integrity and honesty guidelines.</td>
<td>The instructor briefly addresses evaluating information sources for accuracy and credibility and the ethical evaluation and consumption of data sources—in accordance with academic integrity and honesty guidelines.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning Assistant (LA) and Graduate Teaching Assistant (GTA) Implementation (If applicable)</td>
<td>The instructor acts as instructional guide for colleagues, GTA’s, and/or LA’s. Weekly meetings are held to prepare LA’s and GTA’s for upcoming classes to ensure they are ready to support students during class time.</td>
<td>The instructor acts as instructional guide for GTA’s and/or LA’s. Weekly meetings are held to prepare LA’s and GTA’s for upcoming classes to ensure they are ready to support students during class time.</td>
<td>One or two meetings are held during the semester to prepare LA’s and GTA’s. The instructor encourages LA’s and GTA’s to assist students when asked.</td>
<td>The main role of LA’s and GTA’s is to grade student work. Little to no interaction with students is encouraged.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
STUDENT MOTIVATION DOMAIN

Student Motivation is sparked by the perceived value or benefit of the academic content or task. When instructors use a variety of researched motivation techniques, student involvement and commitment to learning increases.

Choose from these evidence-based teaching practices to motivate students, especially when content is difficult.

### Instructional Motivation Techniques

- Use content and connections that align with your current group of students' backgrounds, interests, and reasons for taking the course.
- Share your enthusiasm, professional research interests, and experiences with the content.
- Promote growth mindset and students' resilience by shifting attention to problem solving, appropriately scaled challenges, and working through failure.
- Support students when working in groups.
- Provide opportunities for students to teach and learn from their peers.
- Teach from everywhere in the room, not just from behind the podium.

### Instructional Language

- Use positive language when discussing challenging topics.
- If students struggle, remind them they don’t know it yet to reinforce that you believe they will eventually reach their goal.
- When giving feedback, use language that honors attempts, promotes growth, and provides hope to students.
- Use varied names and socio-cultural contexts in stories, test questions and assignments.

### Instructional Design for Motivation

- Provide opportunities for students to engage in a variety of learning modalities: group learning, peer learning, individual learning, learning with technology, etc.
- Challenge students with deep learning (case studies, community engaged learning, collaborative projects, etc.)
- Acknowledge student effort; allow room in your grading for risk-taking and error.
- Gauge the rigor of your instruction. Is it at a level that will provide the correct learning edge for students?
- Make content relevant to all students’ lives; clearly link concepts/lessons to industry, a broader purpose, future classes/activities, or a transferable skill.

### Student Engagement

- Encourage behavioral, emotional, and cognitive engagement in your course.
- Engage students’ emotions to see their potential to make the world a better place.
LEVELED CRITERIA & SELF-ASSESSMENT RUBRIC

Use this rubric to reflect on your current instructional practices, set a teaching goal, and monitor growth. TILT recommends revisiting this throughout the year to continue to reflect and adjust as you work towards your goal. TILT does not recommend using this as an observation tool or for direct evaluation. See TILT’s Recommended Process for Annual Review of Teaching to learn more about how to utilize this resource.

STUDENT MOTIVATION DOMAIN

Student Motivation is sparked by the perceived value or benefit of the academic content or task. When instructors use a variety of researched motivation techniques, student involvement and commitment to learning increases.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Developing</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Instructional Motivation Techniques • Use of motivation techniques</td>
<td>The instructor connects content with all current students' backgrounds and interests, teaches about and promotes growth mindset, and provides direct support and other motivators for students throughout the semester.</td>
<td>The instructor connects content with most current students' backgrounds or interests, promotes growth mindset and provides support and other motivators for students most of the time.</td>
<td>The instructor connects content with many current students' backgrounds or interests, remains positive and provides some support and other motivators for students when engaging in difficult tasks.</td>
<td>The instructor connects content with some current students' backgrounds or interests and attempts to remain positive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructional Language • Frequency and quality of motivational/inclusive language used during class</td>
<td>The instructor consistently uses language that includes all students, encourages students, honors effort, and demonstrates belief in student abilities.</td>
<td>The instructor often uses language that includes all students, encourages students, honors effort, and demonstrates belief in student abilities.</td>
<td>The instructor occasionally uses language that encourages students or demonstrates belief in student abilities. The language might not feel inclusive to all students.</td>
<td>Instructor occasionally uses standard phrases to encourage students (e.g., “good job,” “you can do it,” “if you study, you’ll do better on the test”) or does not encourage students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructional Design for Motivation • Variety of learning modalities • Modeling of classroom engagement • Connections within the course, curriculum, and beyond</td>
<td>Instructional design is intentional and includes a variety of learning modalities, activities, and connections to engage students with content. Instructor frequently models how students can best engage with content and each other.</td>
<td>Instructional design includes some variety of learning modalities, activities, and connections to engage students with content. Instructor sometimes models how students can best engage with content and each other.</td>
<td>Instructional design includes little variety of learning modalities, activities, or connections to engage students with content. Instructor occasionally models how students can best engage with content and each other.</td>
<td>Instruction includes minimal to no variety of learning modalities or activities, or connections to engage students with content. Instructor does not model how students can engage with content and each other.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Engagement • Frequency and level of student participation</td>
<td>Most students remain engaged in classroom activity (independently and collaboratively) and demonstrate active pursuit of content knowledge.</td>
<td>Many students remain engaged in classroom activity (independently and collaboratively) and demonstrate interest in content.</td>
<td>Some students are actively engaged in classroom activities either independently or collaboratively; some students appear to not be engaged.</td>
<td>Few students appear to remain engaged in classroom activity or the level of student engagement is unknown.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Choose from these evidence-based assessment practices to give students frequent and valuable feedback on their learning.

**First Four Weeks**
- Use low-stakes assessments during the First Four Weeks of class.
- Administer a mini-exam at the same difficulty level as larger exams.
- Structure time for students to engage in self/peer assessment.
- Provide structure and guidelines for student group work and group assignments; guide and reteach skills for productive, inclusive group work.

**Summative Assessment**
- Align assessments with objectives; share this alignment with students.
- Create rubrics for assignments, papers, and presentations; share rubrics with students when presenting the assignment.
- Use rubrics as a teaching and learning tool.
- Vary assessments: quizzes, exams, assignments, papers, projects, simulations, and presentations.
- Create real-world, authentic assessment opportunities.
- Scaffold large assignments: divide large assignments into small segments, allow for rough drafts, revisions, and peer feedback.
- Give students opportunities to engage in self/peer assessment drafts of their assignment using the rubric.
- Consider group quizzes or tests in addition to individual testing.
- Provide transparent assignment directions: start with this template.
- Engage students in project “exemplar” analysis before an assignment is due.

**Formative Assessment**
- Use Classroom Assessment Techniques to check for understanding and to promote mental retrieval and deep learning in residential, hybrid, and online courses.
- Use technology tools to engage students and check for understanding: iClickers, Kahoot, Jamboard, Google.
- Use “on the fly” in-class checks for understanding: fist to five, think-pair-share, think-ink-pair-share, thumb-o-meter, etc.
- Be willing to diverge from your teaching plan if checks for understanding reveal student confusion or knowledge gaps.

**Feedback**
- Give timely feedback.
- Give specific feedback: ask questions or use sentences like, “The best part of this is ______ because” or “I don’t have a clear picture of ______.”
- Provide guidelines, practice, and support for students to engage in problem solving or give feedback to each other.
- Make sure students know that formative assessment is a form of supportive feedback—not all formative assessment needs to be graded.
- Encourage students to develop test-preparation and test-taking skills by conducting a post-test analysis.

This icon indicates inclusive teaching practices that are fundamental to being an inclusive instructor.

See TILT’s Recommended Process for Annual Review of Teaching to learn more about how to utilize this resource.

Teaching Effectiveness Framework, The Institute for Learning and Teaching (TILT) (c)2023 Colorado State University CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0
**FEEDBACK & ASSESSMENT DOMAIN**

Feedback and assessment are used to continuously monitor performance and communicate progress and levels of mastery to students. Instructors who incorporate frequent and ongoing assessments are able to use these data to adjust teaching strategies and provide feedback to students about their learning—motivating students to be more self-directed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Developing</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Summative Assessment</strong></td>
<td>- Variety and frequency</td>
<td>- Alignment with course objectives</td>
<td>- Alignment with course objectives</td>
<td>- Assessment variety, frequency, and alignment with course objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Assignments aligned with course objectives</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Scaffolding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Assignment examples</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Assessment criteria</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Assessments are varied, frequent, and aligned with course objectives.</td>
<td>Assessments are mostly varied, frequent, and aligned with course objectives.</td>
<td>Assessments could be more varied, more frequent, and better aligned</td>
<td>Assessment variety, frequency, and alignment with course objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>At least one real-world authentic assessment is given.</td>
<td>Most students find assignment directions clear. Large assignments are</td>
<td>with course objectives. Some students may be confused by assignment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>All students find assignment directions clear. Large assignments are</td>
<td>broken into several parts with instructor or peer feedback. Students</td>
<td>directions. Large assignments may require a rough draft, but little</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>broken into several parts with instructor or peer feedback.</td>
<td>engage in analyzing/discussing examples of assignments. Rubrics are</td>
<td>feedback is given. Students may be provided assignment examples.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students engage in analyzing/discussing examples of assignments.</td>
<td>co-created with students.</td>
<td>Assessment criteria is in list form or rubrics shared</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rubrics are co-created with students.</td>
<td></td>
<td>with students when an assignment is introduced.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Formative Assessment</strong></td>
<td>The instructor regularly uses formative assessment strategies and</td>
<td>The instructor uses several formative assessment strategies and</td>
<td>The instructor uses one or two formative assessment strategies and</td>
<td>The instructor does not yet use formative assessment strategies or</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>low-stakes activities, assignments, and/or quizzes to gauge student</td>
<td>low-stakes activities, assignments, and/or quizzes to gauge student</td>
<td>low-stakes assignments to give students feedback.</td>
<td>low-stakes assignments to give students feedback.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>understanding, modify future lessons, make in-the-moment</td>
<td>understanding, modify future lessons, make in-the-moment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>instructional adjustments, and give feedback to students.</td>
<td>instructional adjustments, and give feedback to students.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Feedback</strong></td>
<td>The instructor provides an ample number of low-stakes assessments and</td>
<td>The instructor provides some low-stakes assessments and feedback to</td>
<td>The instructor provides little feedback to students during the first</td>
<td>The instructor does not provide feedback to students during the first</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>feedback to students during the first four weeks of class.</td>
<td>feedback to students during the first four weeks of class.</td>
<td>four weeks of class.</td>
<td>four weeks of class.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>First Four Weeks</strong></td>
<td>The instructor provides some low-stakes assessments and feedback to</td>
<td>The instructor provides little feedback to students during the first four</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>students during the first four weeks of class.</td>
<td>weeks of class.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Feedback</strong></td>
<td>Instructor feedback is prompt, supportive, constructive, and specific.</td>
<td>Instructor feedback is timely, constructive, and specific. Peer</td>
<td>Instructor feedback is timely but may have limited detail. Students</td>
<td>Instructor feedback is limited and is not returned to students in time to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students are taught how to give quality feedback to each other, and</td>
<td>feedback is occasionally incorporated into an assignment or activity.</td>
<td>are encouraged to use instructor feedback to improve future work.</td>
<td>use it to inform subsequent work. Students do not engage in peer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>peer feedback is a regular component of the course. Students use</td>
<td>Students are encouraged to use feedback to improve work before it is</td>
<td>Students may engage in peer feedback for one assignment.</td>
<td>feedback.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>feedback to improve work before it is assessed.</td>
<td>assessed.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Use this rubric to reflect on your current instructional practices, set a teaching goal, and monitor growth. TILT recommends revisiting this throughout the year to continue to reflect and adjust as you work towards your goal. TILT does not recommend using this as an observation tool or for direct evaluation. See TILT’s Recommended Process for Annual Review of Teaching to learn more about how to utilize this resource.
Active Learning

- Use a variety of teaching methods and modalities (verbal, interactive, Socratic, etc.) that align with learning objectives.
- Use Think Pair Share to engage students, break up lecture, or check for student understanding.
- Incorporate Classroom Assessment Techniques for individual processing, partner processing, or small group activities in a variety of teaching modalities.
- Engage students in Community Engaged Learning that meets academic and community needs.
- Support deep understanding of concepts with peer-to-peer instruction.
- Use discussion protocols for an equitable discussion experience.
- Grab students’ attention during the first five minutes of class; finish strong in the last five minutes.
- Support content retention and critical thinking with Writing Across the Curriculum activities.
- Promote deep learning and problem solving with case studies (science case studies).
- Host online discussions in the Canvas LMS.

Learning Technology

- Use accessible slide presentations, documents, videos, and other course materials.
- Provide students with the ATRC Quick Start Guides to share the free assistive technology tools available at CSU.
- Intentionally choose learning technologies that enhance student engagement. Popular apps include: Padlet, Kahoot, Jamboard, Flippity, Quizlet, Edpuzzle, Flipgrid, iClickers.
- Ensure your Canvas classroom materials are accessible:
  - Run the UDOIT for Canvas tool to check your course for accessibility compliance.
  - Share ReadSpeaker for Canvas tool with students.
- Use Canvas, Echo360, or Microsoft Teams to record videos; limit instructional videos to less than 15 minutes.
- Work with Classroom Support Services to learn how to use classroom technology as well as report classroom technology problems.

Science of Learning

- Intentionally embed Science of Learning practices into your instruction.
- Align questions with the level of thinking you want from students.
- Guide students in the three phases of learning (surface, deep, and transfer) to retain, understand, and then apply knowledge to a new context.
- Design classes so that students engage in Predicting, Interleaving, Connecting, Practicing.
- Avoid cognitive overload for students and allow time for metacognition.
- Incorporate elaboration, spacing, and frequent quizzing/testing.
LEVELED CRITERIA & SELF-ASSESSMENT RUBRIC

Use this rubric to reflect on your current instructional practices, set a teaching goal, and monitor growth. TILT recommends revisiting this throughout the year to continue to reflect and adjust as you work towards your goal. TILT does not recommend using this as an observation tool or for direct evaluation. See TILT’s Recommended Process for Annual Review of Teaching to learn more about how to utilize this resource.

INSTRUCTIONAL STRATEGIES DOMAIN

Instructional Strategies that are most effective provide an active and engaging experience for learners. Instructors who use a variety of evidence-based teaching strategies create an environment for increased student engagement and critical thinking.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Developing</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Active Learning</strong></td>
<td>The instructor uses a variety of instructional strategies during all class sessions to increase student engagement, critical thinking, understanding, and connections to learning objectives.</td>
<td>The instructor uses a variety of instructional strategies during many class sessions to increase student engagement, critical thinking, understanding, and connections to learning objectives.</td>
<td>The instructor uses a few instructional strategies during some class sessions to increase student engagement, critical thinking, understanding, and connections to learning objectives.</td>
<td>The instructor uses one or two instructional strategies during some class sessions to increase student engagement, critical thinking, understanding, and connections to learning objectives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Learning Technology</strong></td>
<td>All technology and visual presentations are used intentionally, align with course outcomes, and adhere to assistive technology resource guidelines. Instructor provides rationale and support for all technology use during class.</td>
<td>Most technology and visual presentations are used intentionally, align with course outcomes, and adhere to assistive technology resource guidelines. Instructor provides support for most technology use during class.</td>
<td>Some technology and visual presentations are used intentionally, align with course outcomes, and adhere to assistive technology resource guidelines. Instructor provides support for technology use during class.</td>
<td>Technology and visual presentations are used but do not yet align with course outcomes or adhere to assistive technology resource guidelines. Instructor may provide support for technology use during office hours.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Science of Learning</strong></td>
<td>The instructor designs the entire course with the science of learning in mind with an emphasis on practice, metacognition, and learning for transfer. During class, students practice the level of thinking needed to complete tasks, assignments, or assessments.</td>
<td>The instructor makes many curricular and instructional decisions with the science of learning in mind. Students are aware of the level of thinking needed to complete tasks, assignments, or assessments.</td>
<td>The instructor makes a few instructional and curricular decisions that align with the science of learning.</td>
<td>Course design and instructional practices do not yet align with the science of learning.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Inclusive Pedagogy

References


Curriculum & Curricular Alignment

References


Wiggins, G., & McTighe, J. (2005), Understanding by design (2nd ed.). Alexandria, VA; Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development

**Classroom Climate**

**References**


College and University Classroom Environment Inventory (CUCEI) Fraser: 7 psychosocial dimensions of actual or preferred classroom environment: personalization, involvement, student cohesiveness, satisfaction, task orientation, innovation, and individualization. Fraser, B.J. & Treagust, D.F. High Educ (1986) 15: 37. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00138091


Pedagogical Content Knowledge

References


Oleson, A. & Hora, M. T. (October 23, 2013). Teaching the way they were taught? Revisiting the sources of teaching knowledge and the role of prior experience in shaping faculty teaching practices. Higher Education. DOI 10.1007/s10734-013-9678-9


Student Motivation

References


Canning, E. A., Muenks, K., Green, D. J., & Murphy, M. C. (2019). STEM faculty who believe ability is fixed have larger racial achievement gaps and inspire less student motivation in their classes. ScienceAdvances, 5(2). DOI: 10.1126/sciadv.aau4734


Continued on next page
Student Motivation

References (continued)


Feedback and Assessment

References


https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4020-8905-3_4


Instructional Strategies

References

Active Learning: A Practical Guide for College Faculty, Magna Publications 2017


definitions-and-underpinnings/


References (continued)


https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pscr.2014.08.016
https://www.qualitymatters.org/qa-resources/resource-center/articles-resources/research-video-length